

Cestone, Paul

From: Ju, Kristy (Eun-Mi)
Sent: Tuesday, June 18, 2019 4:57 PM
To: Cestone, Paul; Sherlock, Scott; Shannon, Julie
Cc: Thompson, BrianK; Scully, Carolyn; May, Christie
Subject: RE: eDiscovery EPA and Monsanto names to search on regarding FOIA EPA-HQ-2016-002082 - for review

Hi Paul, Scott, and Julie –

I wanted to follow up on this FOIA request and check in to see if your team will be submitting a request for the post-2013 searches.

Please let us know if you have any questions.

Best,
Kristy

Eun-Mi Kristy Ju
eDiscovery Assistance Team
Deloitte – eDiscovery Contractor
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1301 Constitution Avenue NW (6146C)
Washington, DC 20229
Office Phone: 202-566-2996

Please email relativitysupport@epa.gov for all Relativity inquiries and requests.

Please email eDAT@epa.gov for questions or help on search requests.

Please visit the [Relativity Resource Center](#) to access Relativity training videos and support documentation.

From: Ju, Kristy (Eun-Mi)
Sent: Wednesday, June 12, 2019 12:57 PM
To: Cestone, Paul <Cestone.Paul@epa.gov>; Sherlock, Scott <Sherlock.Scott@epa.gov>; Shannon, Julie <Shannon.Julie@EPA.GOV>
Cc: Thompson, BrianK <Thompson.BrianK@epa.gov>; Scully, Carolyn <Scully.Carolyn@epa.gov>; May, Christie <May.Christie@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: eDiscovery EPA and Monsanto names to search on regarding FOIA EPA-HQ-2016-002082 - for review

Hi Paul, Scott, and Julie –

I spoke with Brian and Carolyn about this FOIA request. Below are several points that I'd like to share:

- **Departed Custodians** - Many of your custodians active years at the Agency pre-date 2013. This involves Lotus Notes or other records collections. The migration of Lotus Notes era emails into the Microsoft Office 365 environment is still ongoing. The eDiscovery Division is coordinating with the Lotus Notes and Microsoft Office teams to determine the most appropriate way to handle searches of pre-2013 era emails and hopes to be able to provide a solution soon. However, we have temporarily paused searching/collecting any emails prior to 2013 within any Microsoft Office-365 accounts at this time.

- **Monsanto as a Participant** – From my test search results below, we saw that the keywords + searching Monsanto in the participant fields yielded 0 results. I took a different approach and found 316 hits by searching “@monsanto.com” without keywords.

Test Search 4

Hits: 326

Unindexed items: 4,757

Custodians Found: Jones.Jim@epa.gov Stanislaus.Mathy@epa.gov BLUMENFELD.JARED@EPA.GOV Maddaloni.Mark@epa.gov Rowland.jess@Epa.gov lewis.susan@epa.gov	Custodians NOT Found: clay.don@epa.gov fisher.linda@epa.gov horinko.marianne@epa.gov Ruckelshaus.william@epa.gov watrud.lidia@epa.gov William.jordan@epa.gov reilly.william@epa.gov (I removed the other William Reilly, who is a current R2 employee, based on our discussion yesterday that the William Reilly you’re looking for has long since retired.)	Date Range: 1/1/2013-6/5/2019	Key Terms: No keywords Participant: @monsanto.com
--	---	---	---

- **Next Steps**

1. [Submit a formal request here](#) with the custodians found in SCC (first column above).
 - The date range needs to be 1/1/2013 – present, as the LN migration is still ongoing.
 - Given the low number of hits for the participant “@monsanto.com” search **without** keywords, I think this is the best search we can use.
2. If this becomes a litigation, our team will collect LN records for custodians who have them.
3. For older custodians like Don Clay, William Reilly, Linda Fisher, Mark Maddaloni, and William Ruckelshaus, who all began at the Agency prior to the widespread use of email, the National FOIA office may be your best point of contact to collect records. The eDiscovery Division cannot collect ESI that dates prior to the use of Lotus Notes.
4. If you have additional questions regarding this FOIA, please contact Brain and Carolyn, cc:ed here.

Best,
Kristy

Eun-Mi Kristy Ju
 eDiscovery Assistance Team
 Deloitte – eDiscovery Contractor
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 1301 Constitution Avenue NW (6146C)
 Washington, DC 20229
 Office Phone: 202-566-2996

Please email relativitysupport@epa.gov for all Relativity inquiries and requests.

Please email eDAT@epa.gov for questions or help on search requests.

Please visit the [Relativity Resource Center](#) to access Relativity training videos and support documentation.

From: Cestone, Paul
Sent: Friday, June 7, 2019 2:40 PM
To: Ju, Kristy (Eun-Mi) <ju.eun-mi@epa.gov>
Cc: Sherlock, Scott <Sherlock.Scott@epa.gov>; Shannon, Julie <Shannon.Julie@EPA.GOV>
Subject: RE: eDiscovery EPA and Monsanto names to search on regarding FOIA EPA-HQ-2016-002082 - for review

Kristy,

So I don't leave you hanging, first thank you for providing these test searches. I provided the information to Scott Sherlock and we need to discuss this more as 10K+ hits is a lot to contend with and may be material not relevant to the requester. I corresponded with Scott and he indicated we should discuss this but I haven't set up a meeting with him so hopefully that can happen early next week. Once I get some direction on this I'll get back to you so we can get a search run for this FOIA.

Thanks, Paul Cestone
202-566-0489

From: Ju, Kristy (Eun-Mi)
Sent: Thursday, June 06, 2019 2:07 PM
To: Cestone, Paul <Cestone.Paul@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: eDiscovery EPA and Monsanto names to search on regarding FOIA EPA-HQ-2016-002082 - for review

Hi Paul –

I appreciate your patience on this. It has been a crazy week! I ran a series of test searches for your request below. Below is a summary of the test results. Six custodians were not found because they are separated employees. It looks like adding "Monsanto" as a participant is far too restrictive (see Test Searches 1 and 2).

I've set the date range beginning 1/1/2013. The migration of Lotus Notes era emails into the Microsoft Office 365 environment is still ongoing. The eDiscovery Division is coordinating with the Lotus Notes and Microsoft Office teams to determine the most appropriate way to handle searches of pre-2013 era emails and hopes to be able to provide a solution soon. However, we have temporarily paused searching/collecting any emails prior to 2013 within any Microsoft Office-365 accounts at this time.

Test Search 1

Hits: 0

Unindexed items: 4,814

Custodians Found: reilly.william@epa.gov Jones.Jim@epa.gov Stanislaus.Mathy@epa.gov BLUMENFELD.JARED@EPA.GOV Maddaloni.Mark@epa.gov Rowland.jess@Epa.gov lewis.susan@epa.gov	Custodians NOT Found: clay.don@epa.gov fisher.linda@epa.gov horinko.marianne@epa.gov Ruckelshaus.william@epa.gov watrud.lidia@epa.gov William.jordan@epa.gov	Date Range: 1/1/2013- 6/5/2019	Key Terms: "polychlorinated biphenyls" "PCB" "Aroclor" "Askarel" (participants:" melissa.duncan@monsanto.com ") (participants:" melissaduncan@monsanto.com ") (participants:" tracy.reynolds@monsanto.com ") (participants:" tracyreynolds@monsanto.com ") (participants:" phil.perry@monsanto.com ") (participants:" philperry@monsanto.com ") (participants:" amelia.jackson@monsanto.com ") (participants:" ameliajackson@monsanto.com ")
--	--	---	---

Test Search 2

Hits: 0

Unindexed items: 4,814

Custodians Found: reilly.william@epa.gov Jones.Jim@epa.gov Stanislaus.Mathy@epa.gov BLUMENFELD.JARED@EPA.GOV Maddaloni.Mark@epa.gov Rowland.jess@Epa.gov lewis.susan@epa.gov	Custodians NOT Found: clay.don@epa.gov fisher.linda@epa.gov horinko.marianne@epa.gov Ruckelshaus.william@epa.gov watrud.lidia@epa.gov William.jordan@epa.gov	Date Range: 1/1/2013- 6/5/2019	Key Terms: "polychlorinated biphenyls" "PCB" "Aroclor" "Askarel" (participants:"Monsanto")
--	--	---	--

Test Search 3

Hits: 10,735

Unindexed items: 4,814

Custodians Found: reilly.william@epa.gov Jones.Jim@epa.gov Stanislaus.Mathy@epa.gov BLUMENFELD.JARED@EPA.GOV Maddaloni.Mark@epa.gov Rowland.jess@Epa.gov lewis.susan@epa.gov	Custodians NOT Found: clay.don@epa.gov fisher.linda@epa.gov horinko.marianne@epa.gov Ruckelshaus.william@epa.gov watrud.lidia@epa.gov William.jordan@epa.gov	Date Range: 1/1/2013- 6/5/2019	Key Terms: "polychlorinated biphenyls" "PCB" "Aroclor" "Askarel" (No participants)
--	--	---	--

Please let me know if you have any questions or if you'd like to set up a call to discuss these test results.

Best,
Kristy

Eun-Mi Kristy Ju
eDiscovery Assistance Team
Deloitte – eDiscovery Contractor
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1301 Constitution Avenue NW (6146C)
Washington, DC 20229
Office Phone: 202-566-2996

Please email relativitysupport@epa.gov for all Relativity inquiries and requests.

Please email eDAT@epa.gov for questions or help on search requests.

Please visit the [Relativity Resource Center](#) to access Relativity training videos and support documentation.

From: Cestone, Paul

Sent: Tuesday, June 4, 2019 12:11 PM

To: Ju, Kristy (Eun-Mi) <ju.eun-mi@epa.gov>

Subject: eDiscovery EPA and Monsanto names to search on regarding FOIA EPA-HQ-2016-002082 - for review

EPA-HQ-2016-002082

Key terms:

“polychlorinated biphenyls”

“PCB”

“Aroclor”

“Askarel”

EPA Custodians:

Known or possible EPA email addresses.

1. Don Clay clay.don@epa.gov Former: Director, OTS & AA/OSWER (89-93); now deceased.
2. William Reilly reilly.william@epa.gov former: 7th EPA Administrator (1989-1993)
3. Linda J. Fisher fisher.linda@epa.gov former: AA/OPPTS (circa 89-93)
4. Marianne Horinko horinko.marianne@epa.gov former: AA/OSWER (01-04); acting Admin.(03)
5. Jim Jones Jones.Jim@epa.gov former: AA/OCSP (2011- 2017)
6. Mathy Stanislaus Stanislaus.Mathy@epa.gov former: AA/OLEM (2009-2016)
7. Jared Blumenfeld BLUMENFELD.JARED@EPA.GOV former: Region 9 RA (2010 - 2016)
8. Mark Maddaloni Maddaloni.Mark@epa.gov former: Region 2 toxicologist (1991-2018)
9. William D. Ruckelshaus Ruckelshaus.william@epa.gov former: 1st & 5th EPA Administrator (70-73, 83-85)
10. Lidia Watrud watrud.lidia@epa.gov former: ORD researcher
11. Jess Rowland Rowland.jess@Epa.gov current: OPP
12. Susan Lewis lewis.susan@epa.gov (current OPP DD 2013-present)
13. Bill Jordan William.jordan@epa.gov (former OPP DD 2012-2015)

Participants (searches to/from/cc/bcc):

Monsanto emails are based on available information online. According to one source, Monsanto Company uses 7 email formats, with first '.' last (ex. jane.doe@monsanto.com) being used 79.630% of the time. Next most common is firstlast without the period -- used 7.4%. These are guesses for Monsanto names of interest.

1. Melissa Duncan melissa.duncan@monsanto.com melissaduncan@monsanto.com
2. Tracy Reynolds tracy.reynolds@monsanto.com tracyreynolds@monsanto.com
3. Phil Perry phil.perry@monsanto.com philperry@monsanto.com
4. Amelia Jackson-Gheissari amelia.jacksongheissari@monsanto.com ameliajacksongheissari@monsanto.com

Other (These names have been associated with PCB-related lobbying efforts)

(We will need email addresses of these individuals – Refer request back to FOIA requester; program office does not have this information; we are not his research assistant. Same with Phil Perry, below.)

Called Judith Nordgren with the American Chemistry Council – June 4 - Will get back with emails if found.

1. Clifford "Kip" Howlett, Jr., Executive Director, Chlorine Chemistry Council
2. M. L. Mullins, Vice President-Regulatory Affairs, Chemical Manufacturers Association